### The Legal Origins of Corporate Social Responsibility

Leonardo Becchetti<sup>1</sup> Rocco Ciciretti<sup>2</sup> Pierluigi Conzo<sup>3</sup>

 $^{1}$  University of Rome Tor Vergata  $^{2}$  University of Rome Tor Vergata, CEIS and RCEA-Rimini  $^{3}$  University of Turin

November 16, 2015

### Road Plan

- Intro
- 2 Literature Review
- O Data
- Results
- Interpretation
- 6 Robustness Checks
- Conclusions

### Motivation and Contribution

Intro

- The legal origin literature documents that civil and common law traditions have different impact on rules and economic outcomes.
- So far, most of the literature has focused on the nexus between corporate social responsibility (CSR) and corporate performance.
- Few empirical contributions analyze how different legal cultures affect CSR choices around the world.
- We contribute to the existing literature by investigating the relationship between CSR and legal origins.

### Main Results

Intro

Consistently with the main differences in historical and legal backgrounds (net of industry specific effects):

- Ocmmon law origin has a significant and positive impact on the Corporate Governance and Community Involvement domains:
- French legal tradition of civil law has a significant and positive impact on the Human Resources domain:
- The lack of observable differences in the Environmental domain can be explained by firms' progressive convergence to industry sustainability standards.

### Legal Origin Literature

Historical origins of domestic legal systems (two main roots: civil and common law) deeply affect legal rules, regulatory practices and economic outcomes (La Porta et al., 2008).

Due to these heterogeneous historical roots two markedly different cultures originated from civil and common law, with state control prevailing in the first and support to private outcomes in the second:

- In the dilemma between addressing market failure with regulation and avoiding state abuse, civil law is more oriented toward the former and common law toward the latter (Djankov et al., 2003);
- Oivil law is "policy implementing", while common law is "dispute resolving" (Damaska, 1986).

### Legal Origin Literature

The legal origin literature also demonstrates that the two different cultures produce significant disparities in terms of rules and economic outcomes:

- Common law countries generally have higher shareholders' and creditors' protection, and higher stock exchanges capitalization (La Porta et al., 1998 and 2008);
- Civil law countries have higher government ownership and regulation than the Common law which are characterized in turn by greater independence of the judicial power with better contract enforcement as well as security of property rights.

How these different institutional features rooted in differences in legal origins translate into CSR characteristics?

# Research Hypotheses

Which CSR domains are correlated with civil and which with common law?

Based on our conjecture, we expect:

- Common law countries have higher CSR scores in the Corporate Governance domain (which is traditionally oriented to promote shareholders' wellbeing);
- Common law countries have higher CSR scores in the Community Involvement domain (due to the two-step culture of profit maximization followed by philanthropic donations typical of the Anglo-Saxon culture described in the section above);
- Oivil law countries (and, more specifically, the French tradition) have higher scores in the CSR labour domain (Human Resources) due to their cultural traditions where law rules in favour of workers are higher and shareholders' protection lower.

Finally, we want to address whether and in which domains there is convergence between civil and common law countries in CSR ratings (benchmarking practices and CSR standards).

### Data Source

Data comes from three main sources:

- Data on CSR scores at company level are from the VIGEO world dataset. CSR scores are defined on six domains: Human Resources, Environment, Business Behavior, Corporate Governance, Community Involvement, and Human Rights;
- Stock price and size at company level are from DATASTREAM;
- Information on legal origins is taken from La Porta et al. (2008) paper.

The time period is 2003-2013; the total number of observations are 8137 with 1834 unique companies.

# Variables Definition by Legal Origin

COMMON LAW		CIVIL LAW	
English	French	Scandinavian	German
Australia, Canada,	Belgium, France,	Denmark,	Austria, Bermuda, China,
Hong-Kong, Ireland, New Zealand	Portugal, Greece, Italy,	Finland,	Luxembourg, Germany, Iceland
Singapore, UK, US	Spain, Netherlands	Sweden, Norway	Japan, Russia, Switzerland

### Variables Definition by CSR domains

In each domain d, the score for company i in industry j,  $FS_{ijd}$ , is computed as follows:

$$FS_{ijd} = \frac{\sum_{k} n_{ijdk} w_{jdk}}{W_{jd}}$$

where,  $n_{ijdk}$  is the score assigned in the driver k to the firm i in industry j which goes from 0 to 100; and  $w_{jdk}$  is the weight (going from 1 to 3) assigned to the driver k in industry j;  $W_{jd}$  is the sum of all the drivers' weights activated in each domain d.

Sector-specific weights  $w_{jdk}$  are computed by VIGEO taking into account the relative difficulty of each specific industry j in implementing CSR standards in each specific sustainability drivers k.

The weighted sum across all the domains defines the Overall score -  $OS_{ij}$  - for firm i in industry j as follows:

$$OS_{ij} = \frac{\sum_{d} FS_{ijd} W_{jd}}{W_{i}}$$

### Descriptive Statistics

Table: CSR, Legal Origin, and Control Variables

Variable	Obs.	Mean	Std. Dev.	[95% C	onf. Interval]	Min	Max
			CSR score				
Overall Score	7000	36.064	12.301	35.378	36.751	4	77
Human resources	8137	28.99	17.646	28.029	29.951	0	84
Environment	8137	31.352	18.381	30.357	32.348	0	87
Business Behaviour	8137	38.892	13.275	38.281	39.504	4	82
Corporate governance	8137	46.239	17.078	45.392	47.087	1	94
Community involvement	8137	36.064	18.547	35.086	37.041	0	96
Human rights	7000	39.391	14.422	38.619	40.163	3	91
_		L	egal Origin				
Civil Law	8135	0.52	0.495	0.491	0.548	0	1
English	8137	0.48	0.495	0.452	0.509	0	1
French	8137	0.229	0.453	0.203	0.255	0	1
German	8137	0.225	0.411	0.201	0.248	0	1
Scandinavian	8137	0.066	0.247	0.053	0.08	0	1
		Ot	her variables				
Total Assets / 10,000,000,000	7749	0.076	0.632	0.044	0.108	0	21.83
GDP (per capita, PPP) /1,000	8135	38.857	8.095	38.451	39.263	6.781	81.10
G/GDP	8135	43.782	7.048	43.391	44.173	14.432	64.90

		A) Me	an CSR Score by	Legal Origin			
Legal Origin	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Human
	score	Res.		Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights
ENGLISH	35.794	24.554	29.842	39.150	55.757	36.996	37.298
	(10.989)	(14.282)	(17.874)	(12.663)	(13.002)	(18.398)	(12.625)
FRENCH	40.097	43.340	39.334	44.560	43.557	44.566	44.625
	(12.856)	(16.052)	(17.369)	(13.396)	(13.819)	(17.556)	(15.326)
SCANDINAVIAN	36.845	35.269	34.771	40.741	44.399	32.718	42.855
	(11.229)	(15.959)	(18.285)	(13.167)	(12.381)	(17.689)	(14.847)
GERMAN	32.120	30.363	34.356	38.013	32.581	33.266	37.501
	(13.320)	(18.088)	(18.757)	(13.156)	(18.324)	(17.953)	(15.362)
COMMON LAW	35.800	24.555	29.849	39.162	55.763	36.998	37.303
	(10.989)	(14.284)	(17.877)	(12.656)	(13.002)	(18.395)	(12.624)
CIVIL LAW	36.239	37.494	36.923	41.639	39.495	38.922	41.327
	(13.387)	(17.908)	(18.173)	(13.625)	(16.451)	(18.618)	(15.644)
	E	3) Test of Mean	CSR Score by Le	gal Origin (t-st	atistics)		
Common vs. Civil	-3.954***	-15.772***	-6.957***	-5.771***	17.305***	-2.121***	-8.974***
UK vs. French	-4.978***	-17.315***	-7.273***	-6.865***	15.273***	-6.277***	-8.371***
UK vs. German	-1.306*	-9.713***	-5.466***	-2.664***	15.436***	0.897	-6.020***
UK vs. Scandin.	-2.622***	-10.110***	-3.436***	-3.541***	9.707***	3.280***	-7.783***
French vs. German	3.257***	5.595***	0.695	3.752***	3.023***	6.943***	1.555*
French vs. Scandin.	1.648**	3.901***	2.425***	2.018***	-2.846***	8.789***	-0.843
German vs. Scandin.	1.313*	1.051	-1.532*	1.195	4.983***	-2.428***	2.071**

Std. dev. are reported in parentheses; \* Significant at the 1 % level; \*\* Significant at the 5 % level; \*\*\* Significant at the 10 % level

## Descriptive Statistics

Table: Mean Deviations from Industry Average CSR by Legal Origin

A) Mean deviations from industry average CSR by legal origin								
Legal Origin	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Human	
	score	Res.		Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights	
ENGLISH	1.095	-0.895	0.459	0.283	5.869	1.221	-0.225	
	(8.317)	(9.756)	(13.344)	(9.811)	(12.026)	(13.776)	(9.685)	
FRENCH	-0.007	2.056	-0.622	0.294	-3.879	0.692	0.986	
	(10.152)	(12.673)	(13.076)	(10.207)	(12.303)	(14.332)	(12.523)	
SCANDINAVIAN	-2.215	-1.206	-1.316	-0.808	-4.033	-5.945	0.156	
	(9.766)	(12.728)	(14.113)	(11.138)	(11.360)	(15.152)	(12.741)	
GERMAN	-1.650	-0.587	0.311	-0.714	-5.351	-1.566	-0.575	
	(9.206)	(11.625)	(13.744)	(9.547)	(11.572)	(12.520)	(11.230)	
COMMON LAW	1.100	-0.894	0.468	0.295	5.863	1.224	-0.220	
	(8.316)	(9.755)	(13.342)	(9.801)	(12.027)	(13.777)	(9.684)	
CIVIL LAW	-1.002	0.679	-0.348	-0.215	-4.454	-0.927	0.206	
	(9.744)	(12.371)	(13.463)	(10.087)	(11.943)	(13.930)	(12.032)	
В	Test of Mean	Deviations from	Industry Average	CSR by Lega	al Origin (t-statis	tics)		
Common vs. Civil Law	3.9577***	-4.2117***	-0.4823	-0.2473	20.2065***	3.4607***	-1.9829**	
English vs. French	2.5585***	-4.9788***	-0.2827	-0.8787	18.0384***	0.451	-1.7040**	
English vs. German	4.0470***	-2.2191**	-1.0706	0.3612	15.8392***	3.8860***	-0.9515	
English vs. Scandinavian	3.4012***	-2.4585***	-0.2366	-0.3054	11.9200***	6.6926***	-2.7290***	
French vs. German	1.4541*	2.5351***	-0.8375	1.1751	-0.7165	3.2695***	0.7045	
French vs. Scandinavian	1.1658	1.5031*	-0.0149	0.3781	-2.7185***	6.3368***	-1.1678	
German vs. Scandinavian	0.105	0.611	-0.6567	0.5695	2.1098*	-3.5324***	1.7726**	

 $Std. \ dev. \ are \ reported \ in \ parentheses; * \ Significant \ at \ the \ 1 \ \% \ level; ** \ Significant \ at \ the \ 5 \ \% \ level; *** \ Significant \ at \ the \ 10 \ \% \ level$ 

### Common Law/Civil Law

#### Table: Random Effects

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Humar
	score	Res.		Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights
Total Assets	-0.115	-0.314**	-0.217	0.139	-0.210	-0.102	0.0387
	(0.104)	(0.123)	(0.192)	(0.175)	(0.199)	(0.405)	(0.131
Civil Law	-5.842***	1.407	-2.368	-2.126*	-25.37***	-6.911***	-1.060
	(1.379)	(1.806)	(1.889)	(1.177)	(2.818)	(1.494)	(1.070
GDP	0.0212	0.0304	-0.166	0.00910	0.168	-0.0508	0.0538
	(0.0901)	(0.0982)	(0.105)	(0.0764)	(0.146)	(0.110)	(0.0841
G/GDP	0.174**	0.183	0.0873	0.128	0.173	0.301*	0.257*
	(0.0848)	(0.154)	(0.107)	(0.0877)	(0.134)	(0.155)	(0.104
Industry dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Year dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Observations	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757
lumber of Countries	27	27	27	27	27	27	27
Number of Firms	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1. Omitted categories: Aerospace (Industry); 2003 (Year)

### Civil Law Specification

#### Table: Random Effects

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Human
	score	Res.	Liviloiiiicii	Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights
Total Assets	-0.0863	-0.235	-0.216	0.170	-0.172	-0.0779	0.0643
10141713513	(0.121)	(0.147)	(0.188)	(0.188)	(0.188)	(0.417)	(0.141)
	, ,	1	` ′	` '	` /	` /	. ,
French Origins	-3.708*	6.576**	-2.067	-0.240	-23.52***	-4.307*	0.516
	(2.119)	(2.755)	(3.060)	(1.871)	(3.036)	(2.402)	(1.952)
Scandinavian Origins	-6.710**	-0.396	-3.627	-2.818	-23.43***	-14.24***	-1.359
_	(2.632)	(2.681)	(3.303)	(2.373)	(3.842)	(2.668)	(2.718)
German Origins	-7.016***	-1.393	-2.279	-3.106**	-26.87***	-7.008***	-1.941*
_	(1.300)	(1.725)	(1.861)	(1.237)	(3.085)	(1.193)	(1.125)
GDP	0.0336	0.0588	-0.150	0.0195	0.141	0.0575	0.0585
	(0.0925)	(0.108)	(0.108)	(0.0792)	(0.146)	(0.114)	(0.0852)
G/GDP	0.154*	0.125	0.0958	0.104	0.120	0.348**	0.234**
,	(0.0793)	(0.115)	(0.108)	(0.0848)	(0.132)	(0.145)	(0.0927)
Industry dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Year dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Observations	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757
Number of Countries	27	27	27	27	27	27	27
Number of Firms	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1. Omitted categories: Aerospace (Industry); 2003 (Year); English Origins

# Common Law/Civil Law: Deviation from Industry Average CSR

#### Table: Random Effects

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Humar
	score	Res.		Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights
Total Assets	-0.0549	-0.220	-0.268	0.136	-0.139	-0.0693	0.0367
	(0.119)	(0.177)	(0.219)	(0.225)	(0.177)	(0.360)	(0.151
Civil Law	-5.335***	1.106	-2.772*	-1.757	-22.57***	-5.733***	-0.983
	(1.248)	(1.544)	(1.541)	(1.085)	(2.867)	(1.091)	(0.968
GDP	-0.0309	0.0157	-0.152*	0.0107	0.0941	-0.164*	0.016
	(0.0834)	(0.0923)	(0.0914)	(0.0823)	(0.136)	(0.0935)	(0.0737
G/GDP	0.118	0.165	0.163*	0.106	0.0636	0.106	0.211*
	(0.0864)	(0.146)	(0.0898)	(0.0815)	(0.114)	(0.113)	(0.090
Industry dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Year dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Observations	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757
Number of Countries	27	27	27	27	27	27	27
Number of Firms	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1. Omitted categories: Aerospace (Industry); 2003 (Year)

### Civil Law Specification: Deviation from Industry Average CSR

#### Table: Random Effects

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Human
	score	Res.		Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights
Total Assets	-0.0863	-0.235	-0.216	0.170	-0.172	-0.0779	0.0643
	(0.121)	(0.147)	(0.188)	(0.188)	(0.188)	(0.417)	(0.141)
French Origins	-3.708*	6.576**	-2.067	-0.240	-23.52***	-4.307*	0.516
	(2.119)	(2.755)	(3.060)	(1.871)	(3.036)	(2.402)	(1.952)
Scandinavian Origins	-6.710**	-0.396	-3.627	-2.818	-23.43***	-14.24***	-1.359
	(2.632)	(2.681)	(3.303)	(2.373)	(3.842)	(2.668)	(2.718)
German Origins	-7.016***	-1.393	-2.279	-3.106**	-26.87***	-7.008***	-1.941*
	(1.300)	(1.725)	(1.861)	(1.237)	(3.085)	(1.193)	(1.125)
GDP	0.0336	0.0588	-0.150	0.0195	0.141	0.0575	0.0585
	(0.0925)	(0.108)	(0.108)	(0.0792)	(0.146)	(0.114)	(0.0852)
G/GDP	0.154*	0.125	0.0958	0.104	0.120	0.348**	0.234**
,	(0.0793)	(0.115)	(0.108)	(0.0848)	(0.132)	(0.145)	(0.0927)
Industry dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Year dummies	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Observations	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757	6,757
Number of Countries	27	27	27	27	27	27	27
Number of Firms	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834	1,834

<sup>\*\*\*</sup> p<0.01, \*\* p<0.05, \* p<0.1. Omitted categories: Aerospace (Industry); 2003 (Year); English origins

### Common Law/Civil Law: CSR Convergence

Table: CSR Convergence

Overall   Human   Environment   Business   Corporate   Community	
Total Assets	Human
(0.00517) (0.00796) (0.0129) (0.0161) (0.00255) (0.0153) Civil Law 0.0773** 0.234*** 0-0890 0.0781* -0.383*** 0.323** 0.323** (0.0345) (0.0348) (0.225) (0.0437) (0.0660) (0.137) GDP -0.00301 0.000322 0.0132 -0.00379 0.00474 0.000675 (0.00332) (0.00321) (0.0171) (0.00291) (0.00306) (0.012) G/GDP 0.00189 0.00745* 0.00751 -0.00563 0.00140 -0.0392**	Rights
Civil Law         0.0773**         0.234***         -0.0890         0.0781*         -0.383***         0.323**           (0.0345)         (0.0348)         (0.225)         (0.0437)         (0.0660)         (0.137)           GDP         -0.00301         0.000322         0.0132         -0.00379         0.00474         0.000675           (0.00332)         (0.0031)         (0.0171)         (0.00291)         (0.00306)         (0.0112)           G/GDP         0.00189         0.00745*         0.00751         -0.00563         0.00140         -0.0392**	-0.00966**
(0.0345) (0.0348) (0.225) (0.0437) (0.0660) (0.137) GDP -0.00301 0.000322 0.0132 -0.00379 0.00474 0.000675 (0.00332) (0.00321) (0.0171) (0.00291) (0.00306) (0.0112) G/GDP 0.00189 0.00745* 0.00751 -0.00563 0.00140 -0.0392**	(0.00372)
GDP -0.00301 0.000322 0.0132 -0.00379 0.00474 0.000675 (0.0032) (0.0032) (0.0171) (0.00291) (0.00306) (0.0112) G/GDP 0.00189 0.00745* 0.00751 -0.00563 0.00140 -0.0392**	0.169***
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	(0.0402)
G/GDP 0.00189 0.00745* 0.00751 -0.00563 0.00140 -0.0392**	-0.00219
	(0.00384)
	-0.000361
(0.00285) (0.00360) (0.0131) (0.00331) (0.00391) (0.0172)	(0.00223)
Score (03-05) -0.0255*** -0.0187*** -0.0446*** -0.0230*** -0.0220*** -0.0372**	-0.0167***
(0.00140) $(0.00202)$ $(0.00756)$ $(0.00266)$ $(0.00212)$ $(0.0165)$	(0.000953)
D. 2006-2007	-0.0438
(0.0230) $(0.0181)$ $(0.0838)$ $(0.0954)$ $(0.0594)$ $(0.0975)$	(0.0421)
D. 2008-2009 -0.0127 -0.0373* -0.115 -0.0631 -0.0812 0.186	-0.0316
(0.0273) $(0.0193)$ $(0.131)$ $(0.104)$ $(0.0634)$ $(0.119)$	(0.0449)
D. 2010-2011 -0.0182 -0.0488** -0.149 -0.0570 -0.0802 0.246*	-0.0467
(0.0296) $(0.0224)$ $(0.169)$ $(0.106)$ $(0.0688)$ $(0.141)$	(0.0484)
D. 2012-2013 -0.0124 -0.0529** -0.184 -0.0522 -0.0968 0.173	-0.0253
(0.0315) $(0.0240)$ $(0.185)$ $(0.100)$ $(0.0661)$ $(0.131)$	(0.0484)
Industry d. YES YES YES YES YES YES YES	YES
Obs. 765 774 768 774 773	765

Robust standard errors clustered by country. Omitted cat.: Aerospace (Industry); 2003-2005 (Year)

### Civil Law Specification: CSR Convergence

#### Table: CSR Convergence

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)
	Overall	Human	Environment	Business	Corporate	Community	Human
	score	Res.		Behavior	Governance	Involvement	Rights
Total Assets	-0.0199***	-0.0145*	-0.0867***	-0.0163	-0.00168	-0.0197	-0.0101**
	(0.00534)	(0.00794)	(0.0135)	(0.0161)	(0.00254)	(0.0155)	(0.00389)
French	0.149***	0.293***	-0.0683	0.112*	-0.405***	0.382**	0.148**
	(0.0355)	(0.0467)	(0.317)	(0.0625)	(0.0802)	(0.157)	(0.0557)
Scandinavian	-0.0255	0.0633	-0.340	0.0995	-0.410***	-0.0115	0.225***
	(0.0606)	(0.0547)	(0.351)	(0.0594)	(0.0967)	(0.163)	(0.0643)
German	0.0243	0.203***	-0.0669	0.0423	-0.360***	0.310	0.182***
	(0.0289)	(0.0203)	(0.155)	(0.0418)	(0.0695)	(0.268)	(0.0415)
GDP	-0.00124	0.00310	0.0170	-0.00398	0.00504	0.00591	-0.00308
	(0.00219)	(0.00219)	(0.0195)	(0.00288)	(0.00310)	(0.0134)	(0.00372)
G/GDP	-0.00159	0.00611	0.0104	-0.00842*	0.00333	-0.0381**	0.000331
	(0.00262)	(0.00353)	(0.0216)	(0.00417)	(0.00422)	(0.0149)	(0.00398)
Score (03-05)	-0.0253***	-0.0188***	-0.0442***	-0.0230***	-0.0220***	-0.0375**	-0.0167***
	(0.00148)	(0.00203)	(0.00762)	(0.00263)	(0.00215)	(0.0165)	(0.000989)
D. 2006-2007	-0.0213	-0.0485**	-0.114	-0.0814	-0.0708	0.0433	-0.0392
	(0.0289)	(0.0226)	(0.108)	(0.0949)	(0.0583)	(0.0875)	(0.0409)
D. 2008-2009	-0.0175	-0.0566**	-0.155	-0.0530	-0.0896	0.139	-0.0258
	(0.0340)	(0.0264)	(0.171)	(0.104)	(0.0621)	(0.109)	(0.0457)
D. 2010-2011	-0.0141	-0.0648**	-0.197	-0.0396	-0.0936	0.196	-0.0426
	(0.0360)	(0.0301)	(0.233)	(0.107)	(0.0673)	(0.127)	(0.0538)
D. 2012-2013	-0.0150	-0.0748**	-0.235	-0.0377	-0.108	0.115	-0.0191
	(0.0346)	(0.0325)	(0.242)	(0.0992)	(0.0653)	(0.127)	(0.0527)
Industry d.	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Obs.	765	774	768	774	774	773	765

Robust standard errors clustered by country. Omitted cat.: Aerospace (Industry); 2003-2005 (Year); English origins

## CSR Convergence

The absence of legal origin influence on the environmental domains.

- We explain this "non result" showing that it is actually the outcome of a remarkable process of convergence between the two legal origin groups;
- We document that convergence actually occurs in all domains but it cancels out legal origin effects only in the Environment and in the Business Behavior domains.

We interpret this last evidence in three ways:

- Globalization reduces the influence of country of origin effects (producing convergence both within and between legal origin areas);
- In some specific domains, such as that of environmental sustainability, the emergence of a global social norm (probably fostered by the creation and generalized voluntary adoption of some international standards) rapidly reduced differences among corporations coming from different legal cultures;
- The increased use of benchmarking practices reinforces processes of creation of global social norms around commonly accepted environmental standards.

Further research in this direction is welcome and may significantly contribute to enrich this field of the literature

### Mundlak Correction

A problem which usually arises when running the Standard Linear Random Effects Model concerns the assumption of zero correlation between the firm characteristics  $v_i$  and all the other regressors.

If this assumption can be realistic with respect to the legal origin variables, it might be posed under discussion when considering the other regressors.

We cannot solve the problem with a fixed effect model since the effect of the (time-invariant) main variable of interest (*Legal Origin*) would be absorbed in firm-specific intercepts.

We implement the Mundlak (1978)'s solution re-estimating the random effect model with the addition of group-means of the time variant variables GDP, G/GDP and TotalAssets.

#### **Attrition Bias**

Another potential bias in our estimates arising from the sample composition of the VIGEO dataset derives from non-random attrition since the probability firms enter and exit our panel may depend on observable and/or unobservable factors possibly correlated with the main variable of interest (the CSR scores).

In order to reduce this potential bias in the main estimates:

- we estimate the firms' attrition probability controlling for year, sector and country
  effects with the addition of the country per-capita GDP and a proxy for the
  difficulty of doing business in a given country (i.e. the number of procedures
  necessary to start up a new business);

Weighted Least Square estimates do not significantly differ from the pooled-OLS. We can conclude that firms' non-random attrition is not likely to be the main driver of our results.

#### Conclusions

- Corporate social responsibility is an emerging and growing phenomenon in contemporary globally integrated economies.
- So far, there isn't any theoretical and empirical analysis on the impact of different legal origins on the implementation of CSR practices in the different domains.
- Two different law traditions (Civil/Common) may have intrinsic characteristics which justify different patterns of adoption of CSR practices:
  - Common Law origin is much more oriented toward shareholder protection concerning shareholder rights and corporate philanthropy;
  - 2 Civil Law origin (French family) is much more oriented toward worker rights;
  - Absence of legal origin influence on the environmental issue is mainly due to the convergence between the two legal origin groups.

# Grazie per l'attenzione

per commenti scrivere a rocco.ciciretti@uniroma2.it